

**Consultation Panel of  
the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

Minutes of the 4th Meeting of the Consultation Panel of  
the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Date : 7 April 2010 (Wednesday)  
Time : 2:30 p.m.  
Venue : Conference Room, Hong Kong Arts Development Council,  
14/F, East Warwick House, Taikoo Place, 979 King's Road,  
Hong Kong

**Attendees:**

Chairman

Professor Stephen CHEUNG Yan-leung, B.B.S., J.P.

Members

Dr. Allan ZEMAN, G.B.S., J.P.  
Hon. Ronald ARCULLI, G.B.S., J.P.  
Mr. Ronald CHAN Ngok-pang  
Mr. Oscar HO Hing-kay  
Mr. Michael HUI Wah-kit, M.H.  
Mr. Derek HUNG Chiu-wah  
Ms. KO Po-ling, M.H., J.P.  
Mr. Bankee KWAN Pak-hoo  
Hon. LEE Wing-tat  
Mr. William LEUNG Wing-cheung, B.B.S., J.P.  
Mr. MOK Charles Peter  
Hon. Paul TSE Wai-chun  
Ms. Ada WONG Ying-kay, J.P.

Government Representatives

Miss Cathy CHU Man-ling, J.P.	Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (WKCD)
Mr. Danny LAU Kam-chuen	Principal Assistant Secretary (WKCD)
Miss Kathleen FUNG Kar-ye	Assistant Secretary (WKCD)1



## **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

1. The Chairman welcomed Members to the fourth meeting of the Consultation Panel (CP) and reported that Mr. Victor LO Chung-wing, Mr. CHENG Chi-ming, Ms. Ida LAM Choi-chu, Dr. MAN Ying-ling, Mr. TAI Hay-lap, Dr. John TSE Wing-ling and Dr. YAU Wing-kwong had sent their apologies for not being able to attend the meeting. He introduced the attending representatives of the Consultants of the Authority - Professor Peter YUEN, Director of Public Policy Research Institute of the Hong Kong Polytechnic University and Professor LEE Ngok, Senior Consultant of Public Policy Research Institute. Representative of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority (WKCD) Public Relations Service Consultant responsible for arranging the public engagement (PE) exercise, Miss Phoebe CHAN, Director of Golin/Harris International Limited, also present at the meeting.

### **Agenda Item (1) – Confirmation of the Minutes of the 3rd Consultation Panel Meeting**

2. The Chairman said that the Secretariat received one amendment proposal for the minutes. The proposal was distributed to the Members at the meeting for their information.

3. Members had no other amendment proposals and the meeting confirmed the revised minutes of the third meeting.

### **Agenda Item (2) Matters Arising**

4. The Chairman said that there were no matters arising from the minutes of the last meeting.

### **Agenda Item (3) – Report on the Analysis of Views for the Stage 1 Public Engagement Exercise for the West Kowloon Cultural District submitted by the Public Policy Research Institute of the Hong Kong Polytechnic University (WKCD CP/01/2010)**

5. The Chairman said that the three-month Stage 1 PE exercise was ended on 7 January 2010. The objectives of the Stage 1 PE exercise were to gauge the community's aspirations for the planning of the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) and the views of stakeholders on the user

## **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

Action  
Parties

requirements for the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities (CACF). In addition, WKCD also gauged public views on their aspirations on WKCD's software development, including the provision of programmes and education-related activities. A total of 66 public engagement events were conducted by the WKCD, comprising one Student Forum, one Youth Forum, three Public Forums and 61 Focus Group Meetings. An encouraging number of over 2,300 attendees had participated in the PE events.

6. The Chairman said that he had participated in some of the public engagement events, just as other members did. He saw participants engaged in lively discussions and gave many useful comments on the overall planning, various arts and cultural facilities, programmes and software development of the WKCD from the users and audiences' point of view.

7. The Chairman added that the WKCD received over 6 600 questionnaires and 400 written submissions during Stage 1 PE. Together with records of the PE events and media reports, over 7 400 documents had been collected in total. These views were then duly recorded and analysed by the independent Analysis and Reporting Consultant appointed by the WKCD and the report on the analysis of views had been sent to Members together with the discussion paper for this meeting. The Chairman invited the Analysis and Reporting Consultant - Professor Peter YUEN, Director of the Public Policy Research Institute of the Hong Kong Polytechnic University, to brief members on the methodology of the analysis and the contents of the report.

8. Professor Peter YUEN, Director of the Public Policy Research Institute of the Hong Kong Polytechnic University, gave a PowerPoint presentation on the Report on the Analysis of Views for the Stage 1 PE Exercise. Copies of the slides were distributed at the meeting.

(The Hon. Paul TSE Wai-chun arrived at 2:45 p.m.)

(Ms. Ada WONG Ying-kay arrived at 2:50 p.m.)

(Mr. Michael HUI Wah-kit arrived at 2:55 p.m.)

Action  
parties

## **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

9. The Chairman thanked the Analysis and Reporting Consultant for his introduction and invited Members to comment on the report on the analysis of views.

10. Mr. Ronald CHAN Ngok-pang enquired about the experience gained in collecting views through the internet, online platforms, facebook and other electronic means during the Stage 1 PE, and how did the Analysis and Reporting Consultant collate and reflect in the report broken sentences or dispersed views. Professor Peter YUEN replied that the report had set out the views from different sources, including over 200 submissions received through internet. The methodology of analysing these views was also used to analyse views collected from other sources. All views had been recorded and analysed, be it a single comment on facebook.

11. The Hon. LEE Wing-tat considered that the findings of the analysis were largely in line with expectations, reflecting that the views of the Hong Kong people were in general reasonable and predictable. He pointed out that some of the views were contradictory and it was impossible for WKCD to meet all of the expectations and aspirations. He asked the WKCD how it would reconcile contradictory views. He was also concerned about the phasing of the WKCD project and considered that though the expectations of the public should be met, we should not build all facilities in one go so as to allow the WKCD to grow organically.

12. The Chairman commented that the responsibility of the Consultation Panel was to listen to public views and accurately reflected them to the Board of the WKCD. Over 7 000 views were received during Stage 1 PE and it was not unusual to have diverse views. We should leave it to the Board of the WKCD to sort the wheat from the chaff and balance the views.

13. Dr. Allan ZEMAN remarked that the primary and most important task was to analyze all of the views collected. Since a large number of views had been collected, it was normal to see diverse views. The Chief Executive Officer and Executive Directors of the WKCD would assume duty soon and they all had rich experience. They had to first take up their duties, get to know each other, and then processed the opinions gathered during the consultation in a gradual manner. He added that open space was very important to Hong Kong and agreed that the WKCD should be developed

## **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

organically.

14. The Hon. Ronald ARCULLI said that the Consultative Committee on the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of the WKCD established in 2006 did not have much discussion on arts training and education. The public clearly expressed their expectations on these aspects during the Stage 1 PE. In addition, a lot of individuals, especially professionals, considered supporting facilities essential to the WKCD. Three conceptual plan options would be revealed during the Stage 2 PE scheduled for this summer. The WKCDA would consult the public on these options and it was believed that it would stimulate more discussions by then.

15. The Hon. LEE Wing-tat was concerned about the timetable of the WKCD development. He pointed out that the WKCDA had to carry out three stages of PE exercise which would then be followed by design competitions for iconic buildings in the WKCD. He was worried that the timetable might be too tight for the WKCDA to properly handle conflicting views. The Hon. Ronald ARCULLI agreed that the development timetable was very tight. Besides, there was a Western Harbour Crossing Tunnel portal within the WKCD site and two MTR routes beneath it. Together with other site limitations, the design process became highly challenging.

16. Mr Derek HUNG Chiu-wah said that the PE exercise attracted the participation of the public and various stakeholders, indicating that this is a positive development in the right direction. Apart from mainstream views, the report also contained demands concerning specific issues. He asked whether individual venues would be combined to serve multiple purposes so as to cater for the needs of different individuals or organizations. The Chairman replied that the three Conceptual Plan Consultants had sent representatives to participate in all of the PE events. They had heard the views of different parties. When the Conceptual Plan Consultants revealed their conceptual plan options, they would explain to the public how their views were incorporated into the designs.

17. The Hon. Ronald ARCULLI added that the WKCDA would consider the best uses of the venues. There were venues operated by the Home Affairs Bureau outside the WKCD. Upon the completion of the WKCD facilities, an overall consideration might be given to combining the uses of some of the

## **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

venues.

18. Mr. Bankee KWAN Pak-hoo asked the Analysis and Reporting Consultant how would the quantitative data be analysed academically in order to accurately represent the views to the Board and how would the analysis of qualitative and quantitative data be balanced in order to accurately reflect the aspirations of the public. He also asked whether the common concepts mentioned in the report were the results of preliminary analysis and only until Stage 2 PE could generalized conclusions be drawn.

19. Professor Peter YUEN replied that the analysis of qualitative and quantitative data could be read from two perspectives. On the one hand, there were views that came up more frequently and had higher text unit counts; on the other hand, there were professional views that were concerned with the design of the arts and cultural facilities and were less mentioned. Nevertheless, both kinds of views must be taken into account. Regarding the overall design of the WKCD, we could make reference to public views with higher text unit counts; while for detailed design of the arts and cultural facilities, we could not judge the significance of views by text unit counts alone. Conceptual Plan Consultants might refer to the analysis on professional views in the report. The emphases and objectives of Stage 2 PE would be different from Stage 1 PE and public views would be sought on three conceptual plan options. Professor LEE Ngok remarked that they would be happy to explain to the three Conceptual Plan Consultants the contents of the report.

20. Mr William LEUNG Wing-cheung said that views of some professional bodies might not seem prominent due to the low text unit count. He enquired about how to ensure views that were concise but with few text units would be adopted by the designers. The Chairman agreed that the significance of views with fewer text units should not be undermined. He said that the Analysis and Reporting Consultant had already set out all the views in the report and the views had also been uploaded to the website of the WKCDA. As a result, there would not be any omissions.

21. Mr Augustine NG added that views in the analysis report could generally be classified into three categories. The first category was about the overall planning. The three Conceptual Plan Consultants had taken part in all of the PE events and noted the views of the public. They considered the

## **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

Action  
parties

views to be valuable for reference. With 40 hectares in size, there were a lot of rooms for creative ideas in the WKCD site. Apart from responding to mainstream views, the WKCD had space to incorporate some alternate ideas. The second category was about performance venues, museums and exhibition venues. These views had high technical content and were useful references for the Project Consultant in preparing the design brief of the cultural facilities. All other views, for example those concerning software development, were grouped under the third category which would make valuable reference for the WKCD in carrying out its duties in the future.

22. Ms KO Po-ling said that more than 6 000 questionnaires were returned during the consultation period which reflected the public's passion for the planning of the WKCD. She expected the next stage of the PE exercise to attract more enthusiastic participants. She was concerned about the weight attached to quantitative and qualitative data in the analysis. She asked the consultant how he balanced the views that were given different weights. Since the public was very concerned about the WKCD's integration with the community and the transportation arrangements, she suggested the WKCD to provide supplementary information in this regard during Stage 2 PE to facilitate even more constructive discussion among the public. Meanwhile, cooperation from government departments was also crucial.

23. Professor Peter YUEN replied that all views, regardless of the number of times they were raised, were tabulated in Chapter 2 of the Report on the Analysis of Views. Text units could only reflect the degree of concern the public had for a certain issue and it was inappropriate to judge the significance of views based solely on the number of text units. The Conceptual Plan Consultants could design their conceptual plan options with reference to the information provided in the report. Mr Augustine NG said that during the PE exercise, the public expressed great concern over the connectivity of WKCD. The WKCD, related government departments and various consultants would maintain close contact during the planning process to ensure the conceptual plan options could reflect the views of the public. As to what concrete responses did the Conceptual Plan Consultants have for the views collected from different sectors, we would have to wait for the eventual conceptual plan options to gain that insight.

Action  
parties

24. Ms KO Po-ling said that it would be difficult for the public to



## **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

express their views during Stage 2 PE when they were unfamiliar with the information related to the conceptual plan options.

25. Dr. Allan ZEMAN agreed that the next stage of the PE exercise was very important. The three Conceptual Plan Consultants would interpret the views collected from the consultation exercise in their own ways and come up with different conceptual plan options. As WKCD would become part of the community, he acknowledged the importance of having good connectivity with the community. In response to Ms KO Po-ling's question about the weighting of qualitative and quantitative data, Dr. Allan ZEMAN considered both of them were equally important. He said that the WKCD should keep an open mind to strive for a balance between the views of the majority and the minority so as to reach a consensus among most of the Hong Kong people.

26. The Hon. Ronald ARCULLI said that the three Conceptual Plan Consultants might not be able to provide detailed information concerning the connectivity of the WKCD with the neighbouring areas during Stage 2 PE. Detail information in this regard might only be made available during Stage 3 PE. He also mentioned that owing to manpower and resource constraints, the WKCD would not be able to realize every expectation and one of the examples was the Literature Museum. He said that he and the Chairman had met with the representatives of the Hong Kong Literary Museum Initiative. During the meeting, he asked why the Literature Museum could not be set up right away at other locations in Hong Kong but had to be incorporated into the WKCD development.

27. Miss Cathy CHU Man-ling said that the content and arrangement of Stage 2 PE would be more complicated than Stage 1. It was potentially difficult for the three Conceptual Plan Consultants to help the public to understand the conceptual plans and explain how their views had been incorporated into the plans. As for the mode of exhibition, apart from three-dimensional models, online or virtual means should also be explored in order to give the public a personal experience of the design and enable them to feel the atmosphere of the WKCD. The related arrangements would be further discussed with the Consultation Panel. She agreed that sufficient information should be provided in Stage 2 PE to facilitate discussion.

Action  
parties

28. The Hon. Paul TSE Wai-chun said that according to the

## **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

questionnaire survey targeting visitors to Hong Kong, over 70% of respondents hailed from the Mainland or other Asian countries while respondents from Europe or America were relatively few. He was aware that arts development was more advanced in Europe in comparison with Hong Kong and even Asia. Therefore, the proportion of European and American visitors in the interviews should be increased in order to gain a more complete picture of the views and preferences of international visitors. He was concerned that the statistics in the current report emphasised the preferences of visitors from the Mainland. He asked about the percentage of overseas visitors in face-to-face interviews.

29. Professor Peter YUEN replied that around 20% of respondents in the questionnaire survey targeting visitors to Hong Kong were from overseas countries. Interviews were conducted randomly by the interviewers. The origins of visitors being interviewed corresponded to their respective percentages in the total number of overseas visitors in Hong Kong, although there were also limitations. That is why the survey could not focus on the views of visitors from a certain region.

(Post-meeting note: The Analysis and Reporting Consultant provided the Hon. Paul TSE Wai-chun with the number of visitors by their region of origin (see Annex) on 9 April through the Secretariat.)

30. Dr. Allan ZEMAN agreed that the WKCD should maintain to be international. In fact, the Chief Executive Officer of the WKCD was a renowned figure internationally while the Executive Directors predominantly came from Hong Kong, thus achieving a good balance between international and local culture.

31. The Hon. Paul TSE Wai-chun proposed to contact foreigners in Europe, America, Australia and other overseas countries who had never been to Hong Kong before or had no interest in visiting Hong Kong in recent years during the next stage of the PE exercise. He suggested consulting the views of foreigners in overseas countries such as Europe and America through other channels such as the Hong Kong Tourism Board. The Chairman said that the Hon. Paul TSE Wai-chun might help with liaison in the future and present options for the WKCDA's consideration.

32. Ms Ada WONG Ying-kay said that it was obvious from the report that there were significant concerns on software development, manpower

**Consultation Panel of  
the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

Action  
parties

training, software and hardware coordinations and arts education. She pointed out that before the completion of the WKCD, the Government had to formulate a five or six-year plan to boost Hong Kong's arts education and manpower training. This was an initiative that should be led by the Government.

33. Mr Oscar HO Hing-kay said that the WKCD consultation exercise required the participation of all Hong Kong people. Therefore, apart from consulting the views of stakeholders of the arts and cultural sector and audience of arts programmes, conducting street interviews was another important means to collect public views. He asked whether the Analysis and Reporting Consultant had compared the preferences of the arts sector and general public. For example, for residents living in remote areas, the biggest concern for them might be the fare required to get to the WKCD. He hoped that during the next stage of the PE exercise, residents of the neighbouring areas of WKCD, such as Jordan and Yau Ma Tei, would be specifically consulted for their views on the WKCD. It was necessary to carry out a region-based detailed study.

34. The Chairman replied that the questionnaire survey had already divided the respondents into different categories, such as whether they had used arts and cultural facilities before and the number of times they used those facilities. Professor Peter YUEN said that the survey involved comparative analysis of the respondents' age groups, the facilities they chose and the number of times they visited those facilities. The results showed that the group was an important factor affecting the choice of arts and cultural venues. The survey classified respondents according to the districts they lived in, namely Hong Kong, Kowloon and New Territories. It was suggested that more refined distinction should be used for the next stage of the PE exercise so as to find out if residents of different districts held different views. Findings from self-returned completed questionnaires and face-to-face interviews with local residents were similar, suggesting local residents shared similar preferences. Mr Oscar HO Hing-kay asked if it had something to do with how the questions were framed, for example asking a general preference question might get you general answers from different respondents. Professor Peter YUEN replied that the adjectives used to frame the questions were approved and considered helpful by the Conceptual Plan Consultants.

Action  
parties

## **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

35. The Hon. Ronald ARCULLI added that the Conceptual Plan Consultants acknowledged the importance of the connectivity of the WKCD with neighbouring areas as well as the attractiveness of the WKCD itself. He also agreed with Ms Ada WONG Ying-kay on the importance of arts education and talent training and expected the Government to make longer term planning.

36. The Chairman agreed that the connectivity of the WKCD with neighbouring areas and how the WKCD could revitalize the Yau Tsim Mong District were issues worth studying.

37. Mr MOK Charles Peter asked how would the WKCDA handle the findings of the PE and if the WKCDA had distributed the report to organizations which had been invited to take part in group discussions. He remarked that although the report had been uploaded to the WKCDA website, the WKCDA should go the extra mile to inform the public of the consultation report and ensure their continuous participation in the WKCD matters. Meanwhile, the WKCDA should also explain to the public on the use of the consultation findings and the time frame for the next stage of PE so as to facilitate the participation of the public in Stage 2 PE. He considered that the public might not be interested in a written report. To enable the public to have a better understanding of the exercise, he suggested shooting a short video to sum up the PE exercise and upload the video to the web. The Chairman said that consideration would be given to continue engaging the public through facebook and other channels.

Public  
Relations  
Services  
Consultant

38. Mr Augustine NG said that all organizations which took part in the Stage 1 PE had been notified in writing of the completion of Stage 1 PE. A hyperlink to the analysis report on the WKCDA website had been provided in the mail/email for easy online access.

*(Agenda Item (3) ended at 4:15 p.m.)*

### **Agenda Item (4): Other Matters**

#### Stage 2 Public Engagement Exercise

Action  
parties

39. The Chairman said that upon the completion of Stage 1 PE came

## **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

the preparation of Stage 2 PE. The Chairman invited Ms. Phoebe CHAN, representative from the public relations consultancy firm, to brief the meeting on the consultation details of and preliminary ideas for Stage 2 PE.

40. Ms Phoebe CHAN said that with reference to the views of the public, the three conceptual plan consultants would each prepare a conceptual plan accompanied by a three-dimensional model for public display during Stage 2 PE. The public relations consultancy firm planned to launch a roving exhibition across Hong Kong to solicit public comments on the conceptual plans. She welcomed members to comment and advise on the mode of the exhibition, the choice of locations and time, and how best to convey the ideas behind the conceptual plans and encourage public participation. Professor LEE Ngok pointed out that the Hong Kong Polytechnic University had conducted a similar public consultation exercise on the design of the Tamar Government Headquarters in collaboration with the Government so they might share relevant experience.

Public  
Relations  
Services  
Consultant

41. Mr Derek HUNG Chiu-wah mentioned that the MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL) had applied for the Town Planning Board's (TPB) permission to relax the height restrictions for the site at the Express Rail Link Terminus. He asked if the Conceptual Plan Consultants knew about the application and if they could provide comments on the design.

42. Mr Augustine NG said that the MTRCL's application was in response to the TPB's demand to reduce the number of proposed buildings from three to two with a view to minimizing building bulk. However, the building heights would be increased accordingly. As for the planning of the WKCD, the TPB had already set out the building height restrictions with the exception of the arts and cultural facilities which enjoyed a certain degree of flexibility. The WKCDA had maintained close contact with the Conceptual Plan Consultants and informed them on the latest developments in the neighbouring areas of the WKCD for reference where appropriate.

43. The Chairman said that Members could submit their comments on the arrangements of Stage 2 PE in writing to the Secretariat within two weeks after the meeting.

Action  
parties

**Consultation Panel of  
the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

(Post-meeting Note: The Secretariat sent emails to all members on 13 April to briefly introduce the background and purpose of Stage 2 PE as well as the basic information to be provided to the public, proposed PE events and channels to collect views. Members were also invited to direct their comments to the Secretariat before 27 April. As at the deadline, the Secretariat has received written submissions from 5 Members.)

44. There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:35 p.m. The Secretariat would contact Members to fix the date of the fifth meeting.

The Secretariat of the Consultation Panel of  
the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority  
April 2010

**Consultation Panel of  
the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

Annex

Number of overseas visitors interviewed

Region of Origin	No. of Visitors Interviewed	% of Total
Asia	1,834	82.21
Europe	180	8.07
South America	7	0.31
North America	127	5.69
Africa	12	0.54
Oceania	69	3.09
Other	2	0.09
Total	2,231	100.00

Source: The Public Policy Research Institute of the Hong Kong Polytechnic University